

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: November 25, 2014

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 7th Floor New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:30 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members Absent: Wayne Troyer

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the October ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 832 Barthoomew Street:

Application: Conceptual review of thirteen two-story 1900 sq ft single family residential buildings.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revised proposal had responded well to the previous recommendations. However, they had the following additional recommendations:

- Change the siding on the front elevations to a 5" reveal.
- Remove the AC units from the rear roofs of the proposed buildings.
- Bring the window sills to floor level on Sheet A.33.
- Simplify the design of the brackets on the front elevations.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 3137 Constance Street

Application: Construct three-story, multi-family development.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

4. 833 N. Villere Street

Application: New construction of 1511 S. F. Single family residential building.

Motion: The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The windows of the second level balcony should extend all the way to the floor.
- The rear deck could be at odds with the current Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance (CZO). You will need to verify compliance with Zoning Administration. The ARC recommended lowering the rear deck to grade to comply with the 30% open space requirement of the CZO.
- Louvered or paneled shutters should be added to the front entry for security purposes.
- Three or more windows should be added to side elevations.
- Remove the AC equipment from the roof.
- You verified that fencing is to be installed. This should be shown on the drawings.
- Verify that the proposal complies with FAR requirements.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1117 Montegut Street

Application: Review of an atypical fence and gate design.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

6. 1200 Pauline Street

Application: Revision of approved materials for previously approved design.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

7. 1818 Burgundy Street

Application: Demolition of building and construction of multi-family housing.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

25. 822-24 1st Street

Application: Demolition of existing building and construction of two-family, camelback residence.

Motion: The ARC agreed that although the existing cottage is a four-bay building, a four-bay configuration is not appropriate for a shotgun type building of this width. The ARC recommended that the applicant reduce the width of the building to a dimension more typical to a four bay building. If the applicant does not wish to consider a narrower, deeper massing, the ARC suggested a modified five-bay configuration with the two doors tightly paired in the middle and cased together and two windows on either side, as shown in the enclosed sketch. (A historic, built example of this can be found at 719 1st Street.)

Alternately, the ARC suggested adding a fifth bay which would require an asymmetrical division of the interior space and a second stair (one centered on each door). In either configuration, the openings should be evenly spaced in their respective bays.

The ARC then made the following additional recommendations:

- The number of columns on the front porch should be increased to six (6) in response to the 5-bay configuration. The columns should be 6"x8" and evenly spaced.
- The floor elevation should be reduced to the minimum required by flood grade, most likely 3'-0".
- The floor to ceiling height should be increased to 10'-0" on the first floor.
- The roof pitch should be increased to 7:12.
- The two, round vents in the gable end are not appropriate. A single, rectangular vent or vents paired to appear as a single vent should be used.
- Traditional weatherboards with a 5" lap should be used on the front and sides. The weatherboards may be wood or smooth HardiPlank.
- The headers of the windows should be raised and the windows should generally have a 1:2 ratio, i.e. 3'-0"x6'-0", and should be the same size except where required by use, such as in the bathroom or kitchen (to accommodate the counter top).
- A window should be added at each side elevation at the living room.
- The door and window headers at each floor should align.
- A transom window should be added above the doors on the front elevation.
- The front porch depth should be increased to 6'-0".
- The lattice around the foundation is not appropriate. There should be a chainwall at the front porch and exposed piers with lattice panels between the piers at the sides.

Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the massing and siting of the proposal provided the applicant return to ARC with their recommendations incorporated for additional review.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

26. 720 Jackson Avenue

Application: Installation of 9 cellular antennas on bell tower.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend denial of the application as it is inappropriate as per the HDLC Design Guidelines.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2536-40 N. Rampart Street

Application: Construct three-story, 2300 sq ft, single family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revised proposal responded well to previous recommendations.

However, they made the following further recommendations:

- Simplify the chimney cap by making it a simple triangle.
- The gas lamps should be smaller than shown.
- Windows at the side elevations should be 3'-0"x 6'-0" and double hung.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 4508 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Construct new, two-story, single family residence

The ARC agreed that this proposal does not respond appropriately to the context. Although the HDLC does not restrict new construction to historic building styles, there must be contextual references in scale, materials, proportions, form, etc. I have enclosed a copy of the HDLC Guidelines that pertain to new construction. Please familiarize yourself with these and let me know if you have any questions or concerns.

Elliott Perkins make a motion to recommend denial and request that the applicant resubmit.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

09. 343-45 Pacific Avenue

Application: Retention of inappropriate deck cover constructed without a Certificate of Appropriateness

Motion:

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend retention provided the following recommendations are incorporated, with the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The cantilever at the end (Elmira Ave. side) of the roof be trimmed back to a 12" overhang. The cut should be perpendicular to the ground and a 1x fascia installed to cover the exposed ends.
- The columns should be wrapped so they are 6"x8".
- The open triangle at the sides should be covered with plywood (not OSB) and a 1x8 trim board added to the bottom edge and a 1x6 trim board added along the underside of the roof. Weatherboards should not be installed.
- The underside of the rafters should remain exposed. Painting is encouraged to protect the wood.
- A gutter to match the main house should be added to the end of the overhang.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 2721 N. Rampart Street

Application: Camelback addition.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 912 4th Street

Application: Renovation of existing 8 unit apartment building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the proposed modifications are a vast improvement to the building. The proposed screening device is very successful. However, the living room window on the front elevation should be made larger. The applicant should also investigate the possibility of using larger windows throughout.

Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

13. 1517 Terpsichore Street

Application: Camelback addition.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 501 Andry Street

Application: Construction of 1700 sq ft residence.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the building should be moved as close to the corner as is allowable by zoning. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 1712 Louisa Street

Application: Demolish existing residential building. Construct new single family residence.

Motion: The ARC took no position on the demolition of building. However, as to the proposed new construction, they had the following comments:

- The front door should be grouped together with windows at each side within a contiguous frame or with side lites. The other window on the front elevation should be increased in size.
- Provide masonry piers below smaller columns as is typical of Arts and Crafts residential construction.
- Close the front foundation as a chain wall and provide piers along side elevations.
- Add a soffit beam at the front porch.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

15.744-48 Pleasant Street

Application: General renovation including demolition of existing addition and construction of an addition.

Motion: The ARC made the following recommendations and Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer so that the the applicant may revise the plans and return to the next ARC meeting:

- Reduce the massing at the front of the proposed second floor addition to reduce its visibility.
- Modify the form to allow clerestory windows above the second floor bedrooms.
- Provide 4-panel doors with transoms along front elevation.
- Provide 6/6 windows at front elevation.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

16.3300-3302 Constance Street

Application: Construction of 550 sq ft addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

17.3300-3302 Constance Street

Application: Construction of 550 sq ft addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

18.3019 St. Thomas Street

Application: Demolition of existing rear additions and construction of new rear addition.

Motion: Although the ARC agreed that the proposed modifications are successful, they had the following recommendations:

- The front elevation should have weatherboard siding as opposed to the drop-lap siding shown.
- Because this is a Creole Cottage, batten shutters are more appropriate than louvered shutters.

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

19.332 Valette Street

Application: Construct 558 sf garage and 472 cabana with outdoor kitchen.

Motion: Due to the limited visibility, Crystal Mitchell made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

24.4301 St. Charles Avenue

Application: Installation of protective window coverings.

Motion: Although the ARC understood the need for protection of the existing stained glass windows, due to the quality of this Mid-Century Modern architecture, they wanted to exercise caution. Therefore, they requested that two panels of the proposed protective glass coverings be installed for inspection prior to approval: one in the clear coat metal and one in a powder coat that closest resembles the color of the existing concrete frame. John Klingman made a motion to defer the matter until the ARC has reviewed the mock up.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

22.1235 Constance Street

Application: New Construction of single family residence.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the following changes and the details to be worked out at the staff level.

- More windows should be added to the side elevations.
- The dentils should be removed from the front elevation. If the intention is for this building to be highly decorative, the details must be correct. Please contact the Staff for assistance.
- The form of the gable window is not consistent from front elevation to side elevation.
- The porch should be deeper, preferably 6'-0". As this is a deep lot the building could be moved farther back to accommodate this.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

23.715-717 2nd Street

Application: Restoration of a side gallery and 525 sf addition to rear building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- A chainwall should not be installed at the side elevation; the existing piers should remain.
- Perform exploratory demolition in the area of the restored side porch to determine the original soffit/beam/column condition. This condition should be replicated at the new rear porch.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

At this time, there was no further business to discuss, and the meeting was adjourned.